

November 2022

Volume 52, issue 1, Front Matter

Follow this and additional works at: <https://digitalcommons.law.ggu.edu/ggulrev>



Part of the [Law Commons](#)

Recommended Citation

, *Volume 52, issue 1, Front Matter*, 52 Golden Gate U. L. Rev. (2022).
<https://digitalcommons.law.ggu.edu/ggulrev/vol52/iss2/9>

This Masthead is brought to you for free and open access by the Academic Journals at GGU Law Digital Commons. It has been accepted for inclusion in Golden Gate University Law Review by an authorized editor of GGU Law Digital Commons.

GOLDEN GATE UNIVERSITY LAW REVIEW

VOLUME 52

APRIL 2022

NUMBER 1

Editor-in-Chief

LIAM CASEY

Managing Editor

BERENICE QUIRINO

Executive Research Editors

ELIAS HERNANDEZ
SADIE MINJARES ODOM

CATHRYN HOWELL

KOURTNEY SPEER

Website Editor

KAITLIN MARTINEZ

Associate Editors

MALISSA BOWMAN
SIMONE CADOPPI
REBEKAH DIDLAKE
BRENNAN GAMWELL

BRIAN GILLIS
AVA LAU-SILVEIRA
VANESSA LEE
KAITLIN MARTINEZ

Staff Writers

MINH-DANG CAO HUU
ESRA COSKUN-CRABTREE
BRIAN GILLIS
JENNIFER GOMEZ
KAYLA HUGHES

NICHOLAS KIMURA
THOMAS LANGTRY
KODIE MCGINLEY
LIZET PALOMERA TORRES

JOSE JACOB REAL
CHRISTINA ROBINSON
SPENCER SELLERS
GWENDOLYN WEST
CLAUDIA WU

FACULTY ADVISORS

Kathleen Morris (Chair)

Jennifer Babcock

Chris Okeke

Students of the Golden Gate University School of Law publish the *Golden Gate University Law Review* in two issues throughout the year. Business and editorial offices are located at 536 Mission Street, San Francisco, California 94105. Views expressed herein are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect the policies or opinions of the *Golden Gate University Law Review*, or the Golden Gate University School of Law. Letters should be addressed to the Editor-in-Chief at the address above.

Subscription price is \$35.00 per year. International shipping carries an additional \$7.00 charge. Subscriptions are renewed automatically unless a cancellation is received 30 days before publication. Claims for issues not received must be filed within six months of publication or they will not be honored without additional charges. Back issues may be ordered directly from William S. Hein & Co., Inc., 2350 N Forest Rd, Getzville, NY 14068. Orders may also be placed by calling Hein at (800) 828-7571, via fax at (716) 883-8100, or email to order@wshein.com. Back issues can also be found in electronic format on HeinOnline, <http://heinonline.org>. Microfilm copies of back issues are available from NA Publishing, (800) 420-6272.

Notification of change of address must be received 30 days in advance of publication to ensure prompt delivery. Notification should include both the old and new addresses and zip codes.

Member National Conference of Law Reviews

© Golden Gate University 2022

Cite as: GOLDEN GATE U. L. REV.

SCHOOL OF LAW FACULTY

- JENNIFER BABCOCK, Associate Professor of Law; B.A., University of California, San Diego; M.S.W., San Jose State University; J.D., Santa Clara University School of Law
- MICHELLE BENEDETTO NEITZ, Professor of Law; B.A., Santa Clara University; J.D., New York University School of Law
- RANA BOUJAOUDE, Associate Professor of Law and Director of Bar Services; B.A., San Francisco State University; J.D., Golden Gate University School of Law
- RACHEL BROCKL, Visiting Associate Professor of Law and Director of Litigation Program; B.A., San Francisco State University; J.D., Golden Gate University School of Law
- LELAND CHAN, Visiting Associate Professor; B.S., Brigham Young University; J.D., Berkeley School of Law
- HELEN CHANG, Professor of Law; B.A., University of Texas; J.D., Southern Methodist University School of Law
- ERIC C. CHRISTIANSEN, Professor of Law; B.A., University of Notre Dame; M.A., University of Chicago; J.D., New York University School of Law
- LAURA CISNEROS, Professor of Law and Associate Dean of Faculty Scholarship; B.A., University of San Diego; J.D., Loyola University New Orleans School of Law; LL.M., University of Wisconsin Law School
- COLIN CRAWFORD, Dean and Professor Law; B.A., Columbia University; M.A., University of Cambridge; J.D., Harvard Law School
- MICHAEL DAW, Professor of Law and Associate Dean and Director of Law Library; B.A., J.D., Valparaiso University; M.L.I.S., San Jose State University
- DANIEL DEVOY, Visiting Associate Professor of Law and Director of Veterans' Legal Advocacy Center; B.A., University of California, San Diego; J.D., Golden Gate University School of Law
- BENEDETTA FAEDI DURAMY, Professor of Law; J.S.D., Stanford Law School; LL.M., London School of Economics and Political Sciences; M.A., University of Florence; LL.B., University of Rome
- SAMUEL ERNST, Professor of Law; B.A., University of California, Santa Cruz; M.A., University of California, Los Angeles; J.D., Georgetown University School of Law
- ELIZABETH FISHMAN, Associate Professor of Legal Writing and Research; B.A., Brown University; J.D., Stanford Law School

- DAVID FRANKLYN, Professor of Law; B.A., Evangel College; J.D., University of Michigan Law School
- WILLIAM GALLAGHER, Professor of Law and Director of Intellectual Property Law Center; B.A., University of California, Berkeley; M.A., University of Chicago; J.D., University of California, Los Angeles, School of Law; Ph.D., University of California, Berkeley, School of Law
- MARC GREENBERG, Professor of Law; A.B., University of California, Berkeley; J.D., University of California, Hastings College of the Law
- DAVID KAISER, Professor of Law; B.A., U.C. Berkeley; M.A., The Johns Hopkins University; Ph.D., U.C. Berkeley; J.D., Hastings College of the Law
- DAVID FRANKLYN, Professor of Law; B.A., Evangel College; J.D., University of Michigan Law School
- WILLIAM GALLAGHER, Professor of Law and Director of Intellectual Property Law Center; B.A., University of California, Berkeley; M.A., University of Chicago; J.D., University of California, Los Angeles, School of Law; Ph.D., University of California, Berkeley, School of Law
- HELEN KANG, Professor of Law and Director of Environmental Law and Justice Clinic; B.A., Yale University; J.D., University of California, Berkeley, School of Law
- PAUL KIBEL, Professor of Law; B.A., Colgate University; J.D., Willamette University College of Law; LL.M., University of California, Berkeley, School of Law
- ELEANOR LUMSDEN, Professor of Law; A.B., Princeton University; J.D., New York University School of Law
- FIONA MCKENNA, Associate Professor of Law and Director of Legal Writing; B.A., University of California, Berkeley; J.D., American University Washington College of Law
- KATHLEEN MORRIS, Professor of Law; B.A., California State University, Northridge; M.Sc., University of Edinburgh; J.D., University of California, Berkeley, School of Law
- JYOTI NANDA, Associate Professor of Law; B.A. University of California, Berkeley, School of Law; J.D., Northwestern University School of Law
- CHRISTIAN N. OKEKE, Professor of Law, Director of LL.M. and S.J.D. International Legal Studies Program, and Director of Sompong Sucharitkul Center for Advanced International Legal Studies; LL.M., Kiev State University, Ukraine; D.Jur., Free University of Amsterdam

- KATHRYN RAVEN, Visiting Associate Professor of Law and Clinical Staff Attorney, Women's Employment Rights Clinic; B.A., Stanford University; J.D., U.C.L.A. School of Law
- THOMAS SCHAAF, Associate Professor of Law; B.A., The Evergreen State College; J.D., University of California, Hastings College of the Law
- HINA SHAH, Professor of Law and Director of Women's Employment Rights Clinic; B.S., University of Texas, Austin; J.D., University of California, Hastings College of the Law
- RACHEL VAN CLEAVE, Professor of Law; B.A., J.S.M., Stanford University; J.D., University of California, Hastings College of the Law
- ALLISON WANG, Visiting Professor of Law and Director of Externship Program; B.A., University of California, Los Angeles; J.D., University of San Francisco
- LUCAS WILLIAMS, Visiting Associate Professor of Law, Staff Attorney, Environmental Law and Justice Clinic; B.A., California State Sonoma; J.D., Golden Gate University School of Law
- SPENCER WILLIAMS, Associate Professor of Law; B.S., Massachusetts Institute of Technology; J.D., Stanford University
- MARK YATES, Professor of Law and Associate Dean of Academic Affairs; B.A., University of California, Santa Barbara; J.D., University of California, Hastings College of the Law

ADJUNCT FACULTY

Abby Adams	Brian Feinberg
Zakia Afrin	Adam Forest
Ashmeed Ali	Jack Friedman
Drew Amoroso	Helen Hartnell
Marie Appel	Christina Hay
Nicholas Baran	Jon Heredia
Jessica Barber	Sean Herman
Deborah Bardwick	Jenny Huang
Saba Basria	Aileen Ping Huang
Alan Bayer	Lynn Humphreys
Adriana Beach	Alex Jakle
Carole Bosch	David Jargiello
Anna Benvenue	Kieli Joplin
Anne Boulaine	Peter Jovanovic
Curtis Briggs	David Kaiser
Robert Byrne	Nehal Khorraminejad
Timothy Cahn	Caroline Koch
Dannielle Campbell	Rosemary La Puma
Richard Campbell	Andrew Lah
Louie Castoria	Chelsea Linsley
Leland Chan	Alicia Luchetti
Linda Chan	Natalie Lyons
Remigius Chibueze	Christopher Martiniak
Katie Christenson	Jody Mask
Anita Chu	Duane Mathiowetz
Mark Cohen	Robert McFarlane
Lisa Culbertson	Justin Miller
Catherine Danielson	William Morehead
Lorenzo Donati	Justin Myers
Christopher Donewald	Nima Nayebi
Jeffrey Dulfar	Katie Padilla
Yvette Edwards	Jennifer Redding
Marcus Benjamin	Susan Roberts
Eichenberg	Alejandro Rodriguez
George Emmons	Leslie Rose
Jennifer Elowsky	Adam Sand
George Emmons	Amir Sarreshtehdary
John Epperson	Harriet Schiffer Scott
Eric Faussner	Lois Schwartz
Delaram Farzaneh	Okan Sengun

Peter Sherwood
Rebecca Shore
Warren Small
Joshua Smith
Kimberly Stanley
The Hon. Andrew Steckler
The Hon. Edward Torpoco
Julie Traun
Emma Trotter
Monica Valencia
Heather Varanini

David Vogelstein
Kathleen Walton
Julia Weber
Brooke Westling
The Hon. Kandis
Westmore
Steven Whitworth
Lucas Williams
William Woodward
Lauren Zalona
Gregg Zywicke

ADMINISTRATION

Colin Crawford
Dean of the School of Law

Rana Boujaoude, *Director of Bar Services and Associate Professor of Law*

Jessica Bride, *Associate Dean of Law Student Support, Interim Dean of Students*

Laura Cisneros, *Associate Dean of Faculty Scholarship*

Michael Daw, *Associate Dean and Director of Law Library, and Professor of Law*

Peter DeHaas, *Director of Disability Resources and Academic Accomplishment*

Gabriela De La Vega, *Director of Student Financial Services*

Daniel Devoy, *Director of Veterans' Advocacy Legal Center and Visiting Associate Professor of Law*

Greg Egertson, *Associate Dean, Budget and Enrollment Management*

William Gallagher, *Director of Intellectual Property Law Program and Intellectual Property Law Center and Professor of Law*

Paul Gibson, *Director of Administration and Technology Services*

Mateo Jenkins, *Senior Program Coordinator of Academic Affairs*

Helen Kang, *Director of Environmental Law and Justice Clinic and Professor of Law*

Reichi Lee, *Associate Dean for Online Education, Director of Academic Achievement and Associate Professor of Law*

Fiona McKenna, *Director of Legal Writing and Associate Professor of Law*

Kathleen Morris, *Faculty Director of Honors Lawyering Program*

Christian Okeke, *Director of LL.M and J.D. International Legal Studies Program, Director of Sompong Sucharitkul Center for Advanced International Legal Studies, and Professor of Law*

Hina Shah, *Director of Women's Employment Rights Clinic and Professor of Law*

Allison Wang, *Director of Externships and Visiting Professor of Law*

Mark Yates, *Associate Dean of Academic Affairs and Professor of Law*

PREFACE

Welcome to Volume 52 of the *Golden Gate University Law Review Ninth Circuit Survey*. The survey is the only law review in the country dedicated exclusively to decisions issued by the United States Court of Appeals for the Ninth Circuit. The *Ninth Circuit Survey* issue features student-written Case Notes and Case Summaries focused exclusively on decisions of the United States Court of Appeals for the Ninth Circuit. The survey provides students an opportunity to explore topics in depth by analyzing the underlying rationales and effects of its rulings, along with the possible implications these decisions pose for future law. The Case Notes in this edition highlight pivotal and recent decisions issued by the Ninth Circuit, each exploring a different area of law: legal representation for unaccompanied migrant children, whether Oakland's claims against Wells Fargo for reduced property taxes should have been dismissed under the Fair Housing Act, and the implication of Article III standing in an erroneous case dismissal. The Case Summaries explore how copyright and immigration laws have played out in Ninth Circuit jurisprudence.

We would like to express our gratitude to the instrumental people who have supported Volume 52 of the *Golden Gate University Law Review Ninth Circuit Survey*: Dean Colin Crawford, for advocating for the journal and providing us with his continued intellectual and creative support; Academic Dean Mark Yates for sharing his guidance and expertise to the *Golden Gate University Law Review*; Tara Cooley, for her editorial and Bluebook assistance; Professor Jennifer Babcock for her expert guidance and congenial strength in her role as *Golden Gate University Law Review's* Faculty Advisor; professors Heather Varanini and Michael Daw for their continued support of our writers. Finally, we offer our sincerest thanks to each author for their Case Note or Case Summary, as these works represent the culmination of our authors' time, passion, and devotion to critical issues.

As the Editor-in-Chief and Managing Editor for the 2021-2022 year, we have been continually inspired by many aspects of the Ninth Circuit, from its judges and jurisprudence to its history and heritage. We have also been encouraged and energized by the hard work, dedication, and growth of the 2021-2022 *Golden Gate University Law Review* Staff Writers, Associate Editors, and Executive Board Members who worked relentlessly to make this edition possible. A law review issue is never an individual effort, but instead the result of much collaboration. It is our

distinct privilege to present this edition of the *Golden Gate University Law Review Ninth Circuit Survey*.

Liam Casey
Editor-in-Chief

Berenice Quirino
Managing Editor

GOLDEN GATE UNIVERSITY LAW REVIEW

VOLUME 52

APRIL 2022

NUMBER 1

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ARTICLE

Judges of the United States Court of Appeals for the Ninth Circuit	xiii
---	------

CASE SUMMARIES

<i>Soto-Soto v. Garland</i> : Ninth Circuit Rules BIA Applied the Wrong Standard of Review and Erred in Denying a Victim of Torture Deferral of Removal Under the Convention Against Torture <i>Vanessa Lee</i>	1
<i>Dr. Seuss Enterprises v. Comicmix LLC</i> : Ninth Circuit Affirms Copyright Fair Use and Trademark Infringement Precedents..... <i>Brennan Gamwell</i>	11

NOTES

<i>J.E.F.M. v. Lynch</i> : The Jurisdictional Exclusion of Legal Representation for Immigrant Children	<i>Kourtney Speer</i> 23
<i>City of Oakland v. Wells Fargo Co.</i> : Examining the Proximate Cause Standard Under the Fair Housing Act.....	<i>Ava Lau-Silveira</i> 49
<i>Juliana v. United States</i> : Standing on the ‘Eve of Destruction’	<i>Sadie Minjares Odom</i> 79

