

# Golden Gate University Law Review

---

Volume 49

Issue 1 *Ninth Circuit Survey*

Article 1

---

April 2019

## Front Matter

Follow this and additional works at: <https://digitalcommons.law.ggu.edu/ggulrev>

Part of the [Judges Commons](#)

---

### Recommended Citation

, *Front Matter*, 49 Golden Gate U. L. Rev. i (2019).  
<https://digitalcommons.law.ggu.edu/ggulrev/vol49/iss1/1>

This Introduction is brought to you for free and open access by the Academic Journals at GGU Law Digital Commons. It has been accepted for inclusion in Golden Gate University Law Review by an authorized editor of GGU Law Digital Commons. For more information, please contact [jfischer@ggu.edu](mailto:jfischer@ggu.edu).

# GOLDEN GATE UNIVERSITY LAW REVIEW

---

VOLUME 49

JANUARY 2019

NUMBER 1

---

**Editor-in-Chief**

STEPHANIE NATHANIEL

**Managing Editor**

NICHOLAS JOY

**Executive Research Editors**

COREY TIMPSON  
ALICIA VILLANUEVA

**Executive Articles Editor**

TARA COOLEY

**Associate Editors**

ANDREW DIAZ

SHAWN MCCALL

DANIEL SORKIN

**Staff Writers**

SANDRO ALDANA  
ALYSSA CHAVERS  
LETICIA CHAVEZ

KATE CHRISTENSEN  
KYNDAL CURRIE

ALLYSON MCCAIN  
JESSICA ROBLES  
KAI SHINTANI

## FACULTY ADVISORS

Paul Kibel (Chair)

Mark Yates

Students of the Golden Gate University School of Law publish the *Golden Gate University Law Review* in two issues throughout the year. Business and editorial offices are located at 536 Mission Street, San Francisco, California 94105. Views expressed herein are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect the policies or opinions of the *Golden Gate University Law Review*, or the Golden Gate University School of Law. Letters should be addressed to the Editor-in-Chief at the address above.

Subscription price is \$35.00 per year. International shipping carries an additional \$7.00 charge. Subscriptions are renewed automatically unless a cancellation is received 30 days before publication. Claims for issues not received must be filed within six months of publication or they will not be honored without additional charges. Back issues may be ordered directly from William S. Hein & Co., Inc., 2350 N Forest Rd, Getzville, NY 14068. Orders may also be placed by calling Hein at (800) 828-7571, via fax at (716) 883-8100, or email to [order@wshein.com](mailto:order@wshein.com). Back issues can also be found in electronic format on HeinOnline, <http://heinonline.org>. Microfilm copies of back issues are available from NA Publishing, (800) 420-6272.

Notification of change of address must be received 30 days in advance of publication to ensure prompt delivery. Notification should include both the old and new addresses and zip codes.

Member National Conference of Law Reviews  
© Golden Gate University 2019  
Cite as: GOLDEN GATE U. L. REV.

## SCHOOL OF LAW FACULTY

- JENNIFER BABCOCK, Associate Professor of Law; B.A., University of California, San Diego; MSW, San Jose State University; J.D., Santa Clara University School of Law
- MICHELLE BENEDETTO NEITZ, Professor of Law; B.A., Santa Clara University; J.D., New York University School of Law
- RANA BOUJAOUDE, Associate Professor of Law and Director of Bar Services; B.A., San Francisco University; J.D., Golden Gate University School of Law
- STEVEN CASTLEMAN, Visiting Associate Professor and Clinical Staff Attorney, Environmental Law and Justice Clinic; B.A., Yale University; J.D., University of San Francisco School of Law
- HELEN CHANG, Professor of Law; B.A., University of Texas; J.D., Southern Methodist University Law School
- ERIC C. CHRISTIANSEN, Professor of Law; B.A., University of Notre Dame; M.A., University of Chicago Divinity School; J.D., New York University School of Law
- LAURA CISNEROS, Professor of Law and Director of Honors Lawyering Program; B.A., University of San Diego; J.D., Loyola University New Orleans School of Law; LL.M., University of Wisconsin Law School
- MICHAEL DAW, Professor of Law and Associate Dean and Director, Law Library; B.A., J.D., Valparaiso University; M.L.I.S., San Jose State University
- JOHANNA DENNIS, Associate Professor of Law and Associate Director, Legal Writing; B.A., Rutgers University; J.D., Temple University School of Law; M.S., Biotechnology, Johns Hopkins University; M.A.E.D., Trident University
- DANIEL DEVOY, Visiting Associate Professor of Law, Director Veterans' Advocacy Legal Center; B.A., University of California, San Diego; J.D., Golden Gate University School of Law
- SAMUEL ERNST, Associate Professor of Law; B.A., University of California, Santa Cruz; M.A., University of California, Los Angeles; J.D., Georgetown University School of Law
- ELIZABETH FISHMAN, Associate Professor of Law; B.A., Brown University; J.D., Stanford Law School
- BENEDETTA FAEDI DURAMY, Professor of Law, Associate Dean of Faculty Scholarship; J.S.D., Stanford Law School; LL.M., London School of Economics and Political Sciences; M.A., Political Science, University of Florence; LL.B., University of Rome

- DAVID FRANKLYN, Professor of Law; B.A., Evangel College; J.D., University of Michigan Law School
- WILLIAM GALLAGHER, Professor of Law and Co-Director, Intellectual Property Law Center; B.A., University of California, Berkeley; M.A., University of Chicago; J.D., University of California, Los Angeles, School of Law; Ph.D., University of California, Berkeley, Boalt Hall School of Law
- MARC GREENBERG, Professor of Law and Co-Director, Intellectual Property Law Center; A.B., University of California, Berkeley; J.D., University of California, Hastings College of the Law
- HELEN KANG, Professor of Law and Director, Environmental Law and Justice Clinic; B.A., Yale College; J.D., University of California, Berkeley, Boalt Hall School of Law
- PAUL KIBEL, Professor of Law; B.A., Colgate University; J.D., Willamette University College of Law; LL.M., University of California, Berkeley, Boalt Hall School of Law
- ANNA KIRSCH, Visiting Associate Professor of Law and Clinical Staff Attorney, Women's Employment Rights Clinic; B.A., Virginia Tech Institute; J.D., University of California, Hastings College of Law
- REICHI LEE, Associate Professor of Law and Director of Academic Development; B.A. University of California, Los Angeles; J.D., University of California, Hastings College of Law
- ELEANOR LUMSDEN, Associate Professor of Law; A.B., Princeton University; J.D., New York University School of Law
- HARRY MARING, Visiting Associate Professor of Law; B.A., Vanderbilt University; J.D., Cumberland School of Law; LL.M., New York University School of Law
- FIONA MCKENNA, Associate Professor of Law and Interim Director, Legal Writing; B.A., University of California, Berkeley; J.D., American University, Washington College of Law
- KATHLEEN MORRIS, Professor of Law; B.A., California State University, Northridge; M.Sc., University of Edinburgh; J.D., University of California, Berkeley, Boalt Hall School of Law
- ANTHONY NIEDWIECKI, Dean of the School of Law and Professor of Law; B.A., Wayne State University; J.D., Tulane University School of Law; LL.M., Temple University Beasley School of Law
- CHRISTIAN N. OKEKE, Professor of Law, Director of LL.M. and S.J.D. International Legal Studies Program, and Director, Sompong Sucharitkul Center for Advanced International Legal Studies; LL.M. (magna cum laude), Kiev State University, Ukraine; D.Jur., Free University of Amsterdam

- KAELYN ROMNEY, Associate Professor of Law and Director of Litigation Program; B.A. University of California, Santa Barbara; J.D., University of San Diego School of Law; LL.M., University of San Diego School of Law
- THOMAS SCHAAF, Associate Professor of Law; B.A., The Evergreen State College; J.D., University of California, Hastings College of the Law
- HINA SHAH, Associate Professor of Law and Director of Women's Employment Rights Clinic; B.S., University of Texas, Austin; J.D., University of California, Hastings College of the Law
- KIMBERLY STANLEY, Professor of Law; B.S., Brigham Young University; J.D. (honors), George Washington University; LL.M., Georgetown University
- RACHEL VAN CLEAVE, Professor of Law; B.A., Stanford University; J.D., University of California, Hastings College of the Law; J.S.M., Stanford University
- TERESA WALL-CYB, Associate Professor of Law and Externship Director; B.A., University of California Santa Barbara; M.A., San Diego State University; J.D., Golden Gate University School of Law
- MARK YATES, Professor of Law and Associate Dean of Academic Affairs; B.A., University of California, Santa Barbara; J.D., University of California, Hastings College of the Law

## ADJUNCT FACULTY

Heather Abelson	Nicholas Emanuel
Frank Gerald Adam	John Epperson
Zakia Afrin	Farimah Erlandson
Cesar Alvarado	Adam Forest
Ashmeed Ali	Jason Galek
Andrew Allen	Jonathan Golinger
Manny Alvarez	Johanna Gomez
Marie Appel	James Hastings
Nicholas Baran	Christina Hay
Jessica Barber	Kristin Henry
Deborah Bardwick	Aileen Ping Huang
Edward Baskauskas	Jenny Huang
Barton Bassett	Lynn Humphreys
Rebecca Bauer-Kahan	The Hon. Maria-Elena James
Adriana Beach	Alex Jakle
Judge Sandra Bean	David Jargiello
Anthony Berman	Peter Jovanovic
Christopher Berry	David Kaiser
Kate Black	Erin Katayama
Heather Borlase	Brigit Kavanagh
Basil Boutris	Sean Kiley
Timothy Cahn	Steven Klamm
Richard Campbell	Matthew Kramer
Vitor Campos	Rosemary La Puma
Monami Chakrabarti	Mark Laemmle
Leland Chan	Michael Larkin
Cynthia Chandler	Carolyn Lee
Keith Chang	Marguerite Lee
Remigius Chibueze	Susan Leff
Claudia Choy	Noah Levin
Penelope Chronis	Philip Lo Scalzo
Peter Claude	Jorge Lopez
Matthew Clausen	Alicia Luchetti
Cari Cohorn	Samuel Luzadas
Jennifer Coleman	Sara Malan
Stephen Collier	Bradley Marsh
Lorenzo Donati	Christopher Martz
Jeffrey Dulgar	Duane Mathiowetz
Melissa Eckhause	Justin Miller
Jennifer Elowsky	William Morehead

Gail Mullikin	Catherine Souders
Nima Nayebi	Paul Stam
Daniel Newbold	Russell Stanaland
Ronald Niver	Cliff Stanley
Chinyere Okpala-Chukwuka	Andrew Steckler
Thomas Owen	Deborah Teitler
Elizabeth Rest	Edward Torpoco
Susan Roberts	Tim Treichelt
Sue Rokay	Jonathan Van Loo
Leslie Rose	Jon Vaught
Carrie Rosenbaum	Allison Wang
Roger Royse	Julia Weber
Larry Sager	Kandis Westmore
Adam Sand	Marshall Whitley
Amir Sarreshtehdary	Stefanie Wilson
Harriet Schiffer Scott	Lindsay Witzel
Lois Schwartz	William Woodward
Owen Seitel	Jennifer Wyllie-Pletcher
Catherine Seitz	Megan Yip
Craig Shaltes	Dr. Nancy Yonge
Peter Sherwood	John Zahar
Kelly Shindell DeLacey	Paul Zamolo
Megan Shrout	Gregg Zywicke
Warren Small	

## ADMINISTRATION

Anthony Niedwiecki  
*Dean of the School of Law*

Rana Boujaoude, *Director of Bar Services and Associate Professor of Law*

Jessica Bride, *Associate Dean of Law Student Support*

Laura Cisneros, *Faculty Director of Honors Lawyering Program*

Michael Daw, *Associate Dean and Director, Law Library, and Professor of Law*

Peter DeHaas, *Director of Disability Resources and Academic Accomplishment*

Gabriela De La Vega, *Director of Financial Aid*

Johanna Dennis, *Associate Director of Legal Writing and Associate Professor of Law*

Daniel Devoy, *Director of Veterans' Advocacy Legal Center and Visiting Associate Professor of Law*

Greg Egertson, *Associate Dean, Budget and Enrollment Management*

Benedetta Faedi Duramy, *Associate Dean of Faculty Scholarship and Professor of Law*

William Gallagher, *Director of Intellectual Property Law Program and Intellectual Property Law Center and Professor of Law*

Paul Gibson, *Director of Administration and Technology Services*

Mateo Jenkins, *Senior Program Coordinator of Academic Affairs*

Helen Kang, *Director of Environmental Law and Justice Clinic and Professor of Law*

Magi Lee, *Assistant Director of Bar Services*

Reichi Lee, *Director of Academic Development and Associate Professor of Law*

Andrea Loh, *Director of Employer Outreach*

Usha Manandhar, *Senior Program Coordinator for Law Student Support*

Fiona McKenna, *Director of Legal Writing and Associate Professor of Law*

Justin McNealy, *Director of Diversity and Inclusion and Student Affairs*

Christian Okeke, *Director of LL.M and J.D. International Legal Studies Program, Director of Sompong Sucharitkul Center for Advanced International Legal Studies, and Professor of Law*

Kaelyn Romey, *Director of Litigation Center and Professor of Law*

Hina Shah, *Director of Women's Employment Rights Clinic and Associate Professor of Law*

Neva Tassan, *Associate Dean of Career Services*

Teresa Wall Cyb, *Director of Externships and Associate Professor of Law*

Mark Yates, *Associate Dean of Academic Affairs and Professor of Law*

## PREFACE

Welcome to Volume 49 of the *Golden Gate University Law Review Ninth Circuit Survey*. The *Survey* is the only law review in the country dedicated exclusively to decisions issued by the United States Court of Appeals for the Ninth Circuit. The *Survey* provides students an opportunity to explore topics in depth by analyzing the underlying reasoning, effect, and possible implications on future law. The Notes in this edition highlight pivotal and recent decisions issued by the Ninth Circuit—each exploring a different area of law.

We would like to begin by extending a very heartfelt thank you to Judge Michelle T. Friedland, who graciously provided the introduction to this edition of the *Survey*. Judge Friedland was generous in providing insightful commentary that touches on the Ninth Circuit's history, caseload, and procedures.

We would also like to express our gratitude to: Dean Anthony Niedwiecki who has been an advocate for the journal and has provided us with continued support; Academic Dean Mark Yates for providing his invaluable guidance and expertise to *Golden Gate University Law Review*; Heather Varanini who has our deepest gratitude for her editorial and Bluebook assistance; and Professor Jennifer Babcock for her expert guidance and continued support as *Golden Gate University Law Review's* Faculty Advisor. Finally, we offer our sincerest thanks to each author for their articles as these Notes represent the culmination of our authors' time, passion, and devotion to critical issues.

As the Editor-in-Chief and Managing Editor for the 2018-2019 year, we have been excited and inspired by many aspects of the Ninth Circuit from its judges and jurisprudence to its history and heritage. We have also been energized by the hard work and dedication of the 2018-2019 *Golden Gate University Law Review* Staff Writers, Associate Editors, and Executive Board Members who worked tirelessly to make this edition possible. A law review issue is never an individual effort, but instead the result of much collaboration. It is our privilege to present this edition of the *Golden Gate University Law Review Ninth Circuit Survey*.

Stephanie Nathaniel  
*Editor-in-Chief*

Nicholas Joy  
*Managing Editor*

# GOLDEN GATE UNIVERSITY LAW REVIEW

---

VOLUME 49

JANUARY 2019

NUMBER 1

---

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

### INTRODUCTION

*The Honorable Michelle T. Friedland* ..... 1

### NOTES

*Cassirer v. Thyssen-Bornemisza Collection Foundation: The Holocaust Expropriated Art Recovery Act Was Unveiled But Congress Still Has Work To Do*

*Nicholas Joy* ..... 3

*Ledezma-Cosino v. Sessions: The Ninth Circuit Maintains Archaic View That Alcoholism is a Moral Character Flaw*

*Corey Timpson* ..... 27

### CASE SUMMARIES

*Rizo v. Yovino: Another Step Toward Equality Through the Equal Pay Act*

*Corey Timpson* ..... 49

*United States v. Arpaio: The Judicial Limit on the President's Pardon Power*

*Alicia Villanueva* ..... 57

